

Development Management Officer Report Committee Application

Summary	
Committee Meeting Date: 21st January 2020	
Application ID: LA04/2017/2350/DCA	
Proposal: Demolition of buildings at 20-22 Donegall Street and 29a-31 North Street. Partial demolition of buildings with frontages retained at 16-18 Donegall Street, 24 Donegall Street, 13-15 North Street, 17-23 North Street and 25-29 North Street	Location: 16-24 Donegall Street (BT1 2GP) 13-31 North Street (BT1 1NA) Belfast
Referral Route: Full demolition of buildings in the Conservation Area and associated with Major application LA04/2017/2341/O	
Recommendation:	Grant consent subject to conditions
Applicant Name and Address: PG Ltd 49 Berkeley Square London W1J5AZ	Agent Name and Address: Savills Embassy House Queens Avenue Bristol BS8 1SB
<p>Executive Summary: Conservation Area Consent is sought for the full demolition of the following non-listed buildings which are located within Belfast City Centre Conservation Area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street; and • Nos. 29a-31 North Street; <p>Partial Demolition is sought for the following non-listed buildings which are located within the Cathedral City Centre Conservation Area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nos. 16-18 Donegall Street; • Nos. 24 Donegall Street; • Nos. 13-15 North Street; • Nos. 17-23 North Street; and • Nos. 25-29 North Street. <p>The key issues to be considered in the assessment of this application are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The principle of demolition including the planning history • Impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area <p>Planning permission was previously granted for a wider redevelopment scheme (Z/2010/1532/F & LA04/2016/2327/F) which included demolition of these buildings. Conservation Area Consent was also granted for the demolition of these buildings. The previous permissions established the principle of demolition of these buildings.</p>	

The current proposal has been assessed against the Development Plan and relevant planning policy. Proposals for redevelopment of the application site have been assessed in the associated application LA04/2017/2341/O and are considered acceptable.


No representations have been received regarding this application. However, objections have been received to the associated outline planning application LA04/2017/2341/O regarding the amount of demolition and loss of historic fabric across the scheme.

The Conservation Officer has no objection.

Recommendation

Having regard to the relevant material considerations, including previous permissions, it is recommended that Conservation Area Consent is granted subject to conditions. Delegated authority is sought for the Director of Planning and Building Control to finalise the wording of conditions.

If Members are minded to approve the application, the Council will be required to notify DFI under Sections 105(6) of the Planning Act (Northern Ireland) 2011.

Case Officer Report	
1.0	<p>Site Location Plan</p> 
2.0	<p>Background</p> <p>2.1 This application was received in October 2017 in association with application LA04/2017/2341/O which seeks outline planning permission for redevelopment of the wider area. The application for outline permission is being considered at the same Planning Committee meeting.</p>
3.0	<p>Description of Development</p> <p>3.1 The application proposes full demolition of the following two non-listed buildings which are located within the Cathedral Conservation Area and are shown in the photographs below.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street; and • Nos. 29a-31 North Street. <p>3.2 The application also proposes partial demolition of the following five non-listed buildings with retention of their facades. These buildings are located within the Cathedral Conservation Area and are shown in the photographs below.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nos. 16-18 Donegall Street; • Nos. 24 Donegall Street; • Nos. 13-15 North Street; • Nos. 17-23 North Street; and

- Nos. 25-29 North Street.



20-22 DONEGALL STREET



29A-31 NORTH STREET (ST. ANNE'S BUILDINGS)



16-18 DONEGALL STREET



24 DONEGALL STREET



13-15 NORTH STREET



17-23 NORTH STREET



25-29 NORTH STREET (ST. ANNE'S BUILDING)

4.0	Description of Site
4.1	<p>The application relates to four buildings on North Street and three buildings on Donegall Street.</p> <p>Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street are a 5 storey building finished in red brick with ground floor shop units built around the 1920s.</p> <p>Nos. 25-29 and Nos. 29a-31 North Street (St. Anne's Buildings) were constructed in 1912.</p> <p>Nos. 29a-31 North Street was originally a red brick 4 storey building which has been painted and the top storey has been removed. Nos. 25-29 North Street are a four storey redbrick building with ground floor shopfronts.</p> <p>Nos. 16-18 Donegall Street are a four storey six bay stucco building with shopfronts at ground floor built around 1870.</p> <p>No. 24 Donegall Street, built in 1887, is a four storey twin gabled building finished in red brick with red sandstone banding and detail.</p> <p>Nos.13-15 North Street are a three storey faience building built around the 1925.</p> <p>Nos. 17-23 North Street is a three storey art deco building in cast stone with metal windows.</p>
5.0	Planning Assessment of Policy and Other Material Considerations
5.1	Planning History
5.1.1	The planning history of the site is an important material consideration.
5.1.2	The former Department for the Environment (DoE) granted planning permission on 11 October 2012 (Ref: Z/2010/1532/F) for a comprehensive redevelopment scheme known as 'Royal Exchange' extending from Lower Garfield Street to Rosemary Street and from Royal Avenue to Donegall Street incorporating the current application site.
5.1.3	The development description included: <i>'Demolition, redevelopment and part change of use of existing buildings to create mixed use development comprising retail, offices, café/bar use, 2no. retail pavilions, 205 apartments including 6 no. live/work units, with associated energy centre, service areas and above ground car parking, cultural/arts centre, hotel, 2-level basement car park and associated access and circulation, creation of new streets and public spaces, reconfiguration of Writers Square, public realm works, landscaping and associated site and road works. Application also comprises works to restore, alter and extend listed buildings and facades and partial demolition of North Street Arcade retaining its facades, partial reconstruction of end blocks and reconstruction of rotunda on original location'</i> .
5.1.4	In January 2017, the Department for Infrastructure (DfI) approved an application to vary the original Z/2010/1532/F permission to allow for phasing of the development (Ref: LA04/2016/2327/F). This created a standalone permission enabling the approved development to be constructed on a phased basis. A number of associated applications to vary Listed Building Consents and Conservation Area Consents were also approved including a Conservation Area Consent for demolition of the same buildings.

<p>5.1.5</p> <p>5.1.6</p> <p>5.1.7</p> <p>5.1.8</p>	<p>For clarity, the development approved under application reference Z/2012/1532/F and the subsequent related approval LA04/2016/2327/F is hereafter referred to as the 'extant scheme'. Details of relevant planning history are set out at Appendix 1.</p> <p>The first phase of the extant scheme referred to as Phase 1A has commenced and includes the restoration of the former Garfield Bar Building (2-14 Lower Garfield Street) to create 5 café/restaurant units at ground floor, three of which extend to the first floor and 5 apartments at second floor level.</p> <p>As the first phase has commenced this means that the planning permission for the extant scheme remains live and therefore is implementable and in a phased manner. There is also the potential for the approved phasing arrangements to be further amended through the submission of another application to vary the conditions.</p> <p>Significant weight is therefore given to the extant scheme/planning history. It is an important material consideration relevant to the assessment of the current application given that the extant scheme can be implemented with potential for further variation of phasing arrangements. It is therefore a fall-back for the applicant if permission is refused.</p>
<p>5.2</p>	<p>Policy Framework</p>
<p>5.2.1</p> <p>5.2.2</p>	<p><u>Regional Planning Policy</u> Regional Development Strategy 2035 (RDS) Strategic Planning Policy Statement for Northern Ireland (SPPS)</p> <p><u>Local Planning Policy Context</u> Belfast Urban Area Plan 2001 (BUAP) Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan 2015 Draft Belfast Metropolitan Area Plan 2004</p>
<p>5.2.3</p>	<p>Planning Policy Statement 6 (PPS6) – Planning Archaeology and the Built Environment</p>
<p>5.2.4</p>	<p>Other Material Considerations Cathedral Conservation Area Guide</p>
<p>5.3</p>	<p>Consultations</p>
<p>5.3.1</p>	<p><u>Non-Statutory Consultations</u> BCC Conservation Officer – No Objection</p>
<p>5.4</p> <p>5.4.1</p>	<p>Representations The application has been advertised and publicised on the website. No representations have been received. However, objections have been received to the associated outline planning application LA04/2017/2341/O regarding the amount of demolition and loss of historic fabric across the scheme.</p>
<p>5.5</p>	<p>Assessment</p>
<p>5.5.1</p>	<p>PPS6 sets out a numbers of policies against which proposals for the demolition/partial demolition of non-listed buildings are assessed. These include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policy BH 14 – Demolition in a Conservation Area

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paragraph 6.25 of Policy BH 10 (Demolition of a Listed Building) of PPS 6 is also applicable where it is considered that a non-listed building proposed to be demolished makes a positive contribution to the conservation area. 												
5.5.2	The SPPS also sets out policy considerations for proposals in a Conservation Area at paragraphs 6.18 – 6.20.												
5.5.3	The application site falls within the Cathedral Conservation Area.												
5.5.4	<p>In accordance with Policy BH14, in determining proposals for demolition of unlisted buildings in a Conservation Area, the Council is required to take account of the building’s contribution to the architectural or historic interest of the area and in particular the wider effects of the building’s demolition on its surroundings and on the Conservation Area as a whole. Where a building is considered to make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the area, the Council is also required to have regard to the same broad criteria for the demolition of Listed building as set out in paragraph 6.25 of Policy BH10 of PPS 6 which in summary are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) the condition of the building, cost of repairing and maintaining it in relation to its importance and to the value derived from its continued use; b) the adequacy of efforts made to retain the building in use; and c) The merits of alternative proposals for the site. <p><u>Full demolition of buildings in the Conservation Area</u></p>												
5.5.5	<p>The following table compares the demolition proposals in the extant and proposed schemes.</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="284 1131 1444 1377"> <thead> <tr> <th colspan="3" data-bbox="284 1131 1444 1198">Full Demolition of the following non-Listed Buildings in the Conservation Area is proposed</th> </tr> <tr> <th data-bbox="284 1198 742 1265">Demolition Approved in Extant Scheme</th> <th data-bbox="742 1198 1197 1265">Demolition Proposed in Revised Scheme</th> <th data-bbox="1197 1198 1444 1265">Comments</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="284 1265 742 1332">29a – 31 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings)</td> <td data-bbox="742 1265 1197 1332">29 – 31 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings)</td> <td data-bbox="1197 1265 1444 1332">No change</td> </tr> <tr> <td data-bbox="284 1332 742 1377">20-22 Donegall St</td> <td data-bbox="742 1332 1197 1377">20-22 Donegall St</td> <td data-bbox="1197 1332 1444 1377">No change</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><u>Buildings that make a positive contribution to the Conservation Area</u></p>	Full Demolition of the following non-Listed Buildings in the Conservation Area is proposed			Demolition Approved in Extant Scheme	Demolition Proposed in Revised Scheme	Comments	29a – 31 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings)	29 – 31 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings)	No change	20-22 Donegall St	20-22 Donegall St	No change
Full Demolition of the following non-Listed Buildings in the Conservation Area is proposed													
Demolition Approved in Extant Scheme	Demolition Proposed in Revised Scheme	Comments											
29a – 31 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings)	29 – 31 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings)	No change											
20-22 Donegall St	20-22 Donegall St	No change											
5.5.6	<p>Having regard to advice from the Conservation Officer, the following buildings proposed to be demolished in their entirety are considered to make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of Belfast City Centre Conservation Area. Consent to demolish these buildings was previously granted under the extant scheme which represents a fall-back and is a significant material consideration in the assessment of this element of the proposal.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nos. 29a-31 North Street Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street 												
5.5.7	Policy BH 14 requires that the Council gives consideration to the part that each building plays in the architectural or historic interest of the area, as discussed below.												

5.5.8	<p><u>Nos. 29a-31 North Street</u></p>	<p>Nos. 29a-31 North Street are a 3 storey building constructed in 1912 and part of the St. Anne’s Buildings. The upper part of the building has been demolished and the red brick finish has been painted white. The building is considered to make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area through its age, style, materials and in part ascribes the architectural evolution of the area.</p>									
5.5.9	<p><u>Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street</u></p>	<p>Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street are a 5 storey, 5 bay building constructed in the 1920s. The building is finished in red brick with sandstone at ground floor level. Detailing on the building includes brick piers to moulded eaves bay dividers, sandstone lintels, corbelling below cills, minor corncicing above shopfronts and an archway through to the rear. The building makes a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area through its age, style, materials, and reflection of historic plot widths, historic patina and former uses. The building in part ascribes the architectural evolution of the area and is recognised as a backdrop building that provides an architectural, historical and contextual setting for other buildings of interest.</p>									
5.5.10	<p>Policy BH14 requires consideration to be given to the wider effects of demolition on the buildings surroundings and on the Conservation Area as a whole.</p>										
5.5.11	<p>In assessing the part played in the interest of the wider area, the Conservation Officer considers that <i>‘Whilst these buildings may have features that contribute positively to the conservation area, collectively the wider streetscapes and built characteristics do not demonstrate the best qualities of a conservation area. Many of the surrounding buildings are in a state of disrepair, with a significant number being vacant and derelict; which together detracts from the visual amenity and townscape of this portion of the conservation area. In my opinion the value of their contribution is thereby diluted to when read collectively with surrounding buildings in the wider area.</i></p>										
5.5.12	<p>Nos. 29a-31 North Street and Nos. 20-22 Donegall are considered to have features that contribute positively to the Conservation Area but they are not considered significant in terms of the interest of the wider area. The Conservation Officer’s advises that the area in general does not display the best quality Conservation Area given the combination of the architectural merit of some of the buildings and the general appearance of the area.</p>										
5.5.13	<p><u>Consideration of paragraph 6.25 of PPS6</u></p>										
<p>Given that the contribution of this building to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area is deemed positive regard must be had to the criteria in paragraph 6.25 of Policy BH 10 [Demolition of a listed Building], PPS6. This assessment is summarised in the table below.</p>											
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="284 1704 513 1809">Building</th> <th data-bbox="513 1704 703 1809">Contribution (Policy B14)</th> <th data-bbox="703 1704 1129 1809">Assessment of Para 6.25 (Policy BH 10)</th> <th data-bbox="1129 1704 1410 1809">New Development (Policy BH 14) and Conclusion</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td data-bbox="284 1809 513 2011">Nos. 29-31a North Street</td> <td data-bbox="513 1809 703 2011">Positive</td> <td data-bbox="703 1809 1129 2011">a) No condition survey carried out. Signs of structural distress to north (LHS) – External walls have evidence of structural supports, an indication of poor condition.</td> <td data-bbox="1129 1809 1410 2011">Proposed scheme considered high quality and will bring substantial</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>				Building	Contribution (Policy B14)	Assessment of Para 6.25 (Policy BH 10)	New Development (Policy BH 14) and Conclusion	Nos. 29-31a North Street	Positive	a) No condition survey carried out. Signs of structural distress to north (LHS) – External walls have evidence of structural supports, an indication of poor condition.	Proposed scheme considered high quality and will bring substantial
Building	Contribution (Policy B14)	Assessment of Para 6.25 (Policy BH 10)	New Development (Policy BH 14) and Conclusion								
Nos. 29-31a North Street	Positive	a) No condition survey carried out. Signs of structural distress to north (LHS) – External walls have evidence of structural supports, an indication of poor condition.	Proposed scheme considered high quality and will bring substantial								

			Fair condition internally. Currently in Use. b) Building has not been marketed as required for comprehensive development c) Proposed scheme will provide substantial community benefits	community benefits. Proposed demolition considered acceptable in principle.
	20-22 Donegall Street	Positive	a) No condition survey carried out. Fair condition internally. Internal inspection noted leaks and water penetration. b) Building has not been marketed as required for comprehensive development c) Proposed scheme will provide substantial community benefits	Proposed scheme considered high quality and will bring substantial community benefits. Proposed demolition considered acceptable in principle.
5.5.14	<p>Criterion a) of paragraph 6.25 of PPS 6 requires the condition of the building, cost of repairing and maintaining it in relation to its importance and to the value derived from its continuous use to be addressed. No condition surveys have been submitted for these buildings, however, the applicant's 'Proposed demolitions of Buildings in the Conservation Areas – Justification Report' ("Justification Report") indicates that No. 20-22 Donegall Street is in a fair condition internally, Nos. 29a-31 North Street is in a fair condition internally with evidence of structural supports on the external wall, an indication of poor condition. However, this information is not a full structural assessment and is not sufficient to satisfactorily address criterion a).</p>			
5.5.15	<p>Criterion b) of paragraph 6.25 of PPS 6 requires evidence to demonstrate the adequacy of efforts to retain the building in use. It is noted that Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street and Nos. 29-31a North Street remain in use. The applicant has not marketed any of the buildings as they do not wish to sell as the buildings are required for the comprehensive redevelopment proposals currently under consideration and consider that selling the buildings would significantly compromise the delivery of the wider scheme. In the absence of this information the proposal therefore fails to satisfy criterion b).</p>			
5.5.16	<p>The Justification Report states that the applicant's position is that the retention of these buildings would prejudice the wider development of the site and limit the ambition of the exemplary scheme which might be achievable. For Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street and 29a-31 North Street this relates to the potential for residential accommodation.</p>			
5.5.17	<p>Furthermore, the Justification Report states that retention of the buildings would limit the ability to maximise the market value of a heavily constrained site and result in a development which would have a lower economic viability. The report goes on to state that for a scheme to be viable <i>'there needs to be a balance of new architecture to financially support the refurbishment of significant buildings, this is best attributed to the restoration of Listed Buildings and those facades which are deemed to make a contribution to the streetscape of the Conservation Area'</i>.</p>			
5.5.18	<p>Whilst the viability of the scheme is a material consideration, no substantive information has been submitted to demonstrate the impact of retention of these buildings on the overall</p>			

	<p>viability of the scheme. Therefore little weight can be attributed to this consideration. Nevertheless, the merits of the proposed scheme require to be considered and weighed up against the proposed demolitions in accordance with criterion c) of paragraph 6.25 of PPS 6 and the potential for substantial community benefits.</p> <p>5.5.19 The substantial community benefits of the wider scheme are explored later in this report. They include the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - physical regeneration of this area of decline and significant enhancement in the visual amenity of the Conservation Areas; - supporting the vitality and viability of the wider City Centre; - the creation of 370 jobs on site during construction and 1,300 jobs on site during operation across a number of uses; - a significant increase (up to 367 units) in the number of residential units in a sustainable location within the city centre including the provision of 10% affordable housing on site and 10% social housing units off site close by; - the creation of commercially viable fit for purpose office accommodation; - restoration of a number of Listed buildings securing their future use, upkeep and maintenance; - retention and restoration of facades of non-listed building and redevelopment securing their heritage value; and - re-instatement of the North Street Arcade, an historic and iconic shopping destination in the city centre. <p>5.5.20 Indeed, the Conservation Officer states that: <i>‘the demolition of these buildings could play a significant role in enabling comprehensive regeneration and wider redevelopment of the area that is in significant decline and in strong need of rejuvenation; including the retention, refurbishment and restoration of other heritage assets. The benefits of this would, in my opinion be greater to the wider area than the individual contribution of the buildings’.</i></p> <p>Redevelopment/Regeneration</p> <p>5.5.21 The proposed demolition will facilitate the comprehensive redevelopment of the site and enable the realisation of significant physical, economic and regeneration benefits delivering substantial gains which is considered to be in the wider public interest. The merits of the proposed redevelopment scheme are considered in detail in the associated application LA04/2017/2341/O and are considered to outweigh the loss of Nos. 20-22 Donegall Street and 29a-31 North street. Moreover, regard must be had to the fall-back position of implementation of the extant scheme within which this building is to be demolished. Having regard to these considerations, the principle of demolition of these buildings is considered acceptable subject to assessment of the redevelopment proposals. This view is supported by the Conservation Officer.</p> <p>5.5.22 Redevelopment proposals for the application site and the wider scheme to regenerate the area are considered in detail in the assessment of the associated application LA04/2017/2341/O and should be read in conjunction with this application. The buildings to be demolished will be replaced by new buildings of a higher quality design which will enhance the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. A condition is recommended that prevents demolition of the building until a valid contract has been let for redevelopment of the site to ensure that these parts of the site are developed and not left.</p>
--	--

<p>5.5.23</p>	<p><u>Partial demolition of buildings in the Conservation Area</u></p>		
	<p>The following table compares the demolition proposals in the extant and proposed schemes.</p>		
	<p>Partial Demolition of the following non-Listed Buildings in the Conservation Area is proposed:</p>		
	<p>Demolition Approved in Extant Scheme</p>	<p>Demolition Proposed in Revised Scheme</p>	<p>Comments</p>
	<p>Nos. 13-15 North Street – demolition of entire buildings approved</p>	<p>13-15 North Street (partial demolition – façade retention proposed)</p>	<p>Façade retention proposed in revised scheme</p>
	<p>Nos. 17-23 North Street – demolition of entire buildings approved</p>	<p>17-23 North Street (partial demolition – façade retention proposed)</p>	<p>Façade retention proposed in revised scheme</p>
	<p>Nos. 25 – 29 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings) demolition of entire buildings approved</p>	<p>25 – 29a North St (St. Anne’s Buildings) (partial demolition) – façade retention proposed</p>	<p>Façade retention proposed in revised scheme</p>
<p>No. 24 Donegall Street (partial demolition) – façade retention approved</p>	<p>24 Donegall Street (partial demolition) – façade retention proposed</p>	<p>No change</p>	
<p>Nos. 16-18 Donegall Street (partial demolition) – façade retention approved</p>	<p>16-18 Donegall Street (partial demolition) – façade retention proposed</p>	<p>No change</p>	
<p>5.5.24</p>	<p>Having regard to advice from the Conservation Officer, it is considered that these buildings make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Areas in terms of their architectural and historic interest. The Conservation Officer considers that these buildings present heritage features of value including their age, style, materials, reflection of historic plot widths, patina and former functional uses which in part ascribe the architectural evolution of the area. It is for these reasons that the buildings are considered to make a positive material contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Areas.</p>		
<p>5.5.25</p>	<p>The Conservation Officer advises that <i>‘given that the front facades are to be retained I am satisfied that demolition of the remaining elements would not compromise the positive contribution by each building. Providing that the new scheme can be integrated sympathetically and without detriment or prejudice to the historic fabric of each facade; the part played by these buildings in the interest of the wider area would be unaffected. Furthermore, and in the context of the redevelopment scheme as a whole, the wider effects of demolition would not in my opinion be harmful to the conservation area.’</i></p>		
<p>5.5.26</p>	<p>Notwithstanding these conclusions, given the positive contribution of these buildings to the character and appearance of the Conservation Areas, regard must be had to the paragraph 6.25 of PPS6. The assessment is summarised in the table below.</p>		

Building	Contribution (Policy B14)	Assessment of Para 6.25 (Policy BH 10)	New Development (Policy BH 14) and Conclusion
Nos. 13-15 North Street	Positive	a) No condition survey carried out. Currently in Use. Very poor condition externally – deterioration of façade with extensive cracking. Poor condition internally. b) Building has not been marketed as required for comprehensive development. c) Replacement scheme will include façade retention. Proposed scheme will provide substantial community benefits.	Positive contribution primarily based on architectural and historical value of the facade which will be retained. Proposed scheme high quality and will bring substantial community benefits. Partial demolition considered acceptable.
17-23 North Street	Positive	a) No condition survey carried out. Currently in Use. Reasonable condition externally. Poor condition internally. b) Building has not been marketed as required for comprehensive development. c) Replacement scheme will include façade retention. Proposed scheme will provide substantial community benefits.	Positive contribution primarily based on architectural and historical value of the facade which will be retained. Proposed scheme high quality and will bring substantial community benefits. Partial demolition considered acceptable.
25 – 29 North Street (St. Anne’s Buildings)	Positive	a) No condition survey carried out. Currently in Use. Very poor condition internally. b) Building has not been marketed as required for comprehensive development. c) Replacement scheme will include façade retention. Proposed scheme will provide substantial community benefits.	Positive contribution primarily based on architectural and historical value of the facade which will be retained. Proposed scheme high quality and will bring substantial community benefits. Partial demolition considered acceptable.
24 Donegall Street	Positive	a) No condition survey carried out – internal inspection noted water penetration and dampness. Condition fair. Currently in use.	Positive contribution primarily based on architectural and historical value of the facade which will be retained.

			<p>b) Building has not been marketed as required for comprehensive development.</p> <p>c) Replacement scheme will include façade retention. Proposed scheme will provide substantial community benefits.</p>	<p>Proposed scheme high quality and will bring substantial community benefits. Partial demolition considered acceptable.</p>
	16-18 Donegall Street	Positive	<p>a) No condition survey carried out. Building unsafe to enter. Evidence of structural issues - extreme settlement to front elevation. Vacant.</p> <p>b) Building has not been marketed as required for comprehensive development</p> <p>c) Replacement scheme will include façade retention. Proposed scheme will provide substantial community benefits</p>	<p>Positive contribution primarily based on architectural and historical value of facade which will be retained. Proposed scheme high quality and will bring substantial community benefits. Partial demolition considered acceptable.</p>
5.5.27	<p>Criterion a) of paragraph 6.25 requires consideration of the condition of the building, cost of repairing and maintaining it in relation to its importance and to the value derived from its continuous use. No condition surveys have been submitted, however, the Justification Report indicates that No. 24 Donegall Street is in a fair condition; No. 13-15 North Street are in a very poor condition externally with extensive cracking evident on the façade and a poor condition internally due to years of successive replacement material. Nos. 17-23 North Street are in reasonable condition externally and poor condition internally again due to years of successive replacement material. Nos. 25-29 North Street is in poor condition internally but currently in use. Nos.16-18 Donegall Street is unsafe with evidence of extreme settlement of the front elevation. However, the information does not include full structural surveys and is not sufficient to satisfactorily address criterion a).</p>			
5.5.28	<p>Criterion b) of paragraph 6.25 requires evidence to demonstrate the adequacy of efforts to retain the building in use. It is noted that Nos. 13-15, 17-23 and 25-29 North Street and No. 24 Donegall Street are currently in use. The applicant has not marketed any of the buildings as they do not wish to sell as they are required for the comprehensive redevelopment proposals. Therefore the proposal also fails to comply with criterion b).</p>			
5.5.29	<p>Criterion c) of paragraph 6.25 of PPS 6 requires consideration of the merits of the replacement scheme.</p>			
5.5.30	<p>It is considered that the same substantial benefits reported in the previous section of this report, as amplified in the associated report for application LA04/2017/2341/O, also applies to the consideration of partial demolition of non-listed buildings. Moreover, the extant scheme includes the demolition of three of the above buildings in their entirety (i.e. Nos. 13-15, 17-23 and 27-29 North Street). The extant scheme also includes the partial demolition with façade retentions only of Nos. 16-18 and 24 Donegall Street. The extant scheme is an implementable fall-back and a significant material consideration in the determination of the revised scheme. The revised scheme proposes additional façade</p>			

<p>retentions over and above that approved in the extant permission which is considered a planning gain. Individually and cumulatively these façade retentions will serve to both preserve historic and architectural features enabling the heritage value to be protected whilst also enhancing the Conservation Areas through the retention and restoration of the facades.</p> <p>Redevelopment/Regeneration</p> <p>5.5.32</p> <p>5.5.33</p>	<p>The demolitions will facilitate the comprehensive redevelopment of the site and enable the realisation of significant physical, economic and regeneration benefits delivering substantial community benefits which are considered to be in the wider public interest. The merits of the proposed redevelopment scheme are considered in detail in the associated application LA04/2017/2341/O and are considered to outweigh the partial loss of Nos.13-15, 17-23 and 25-29 North Street and Nos.16-18 and 24 Donegall Street. Moreover, regard must be had to the fall-back position of implementation of the extant scheme within which Nos.13-15, 17-23 and 25-29 North Street were to be demolished in full. Having regard to these considerations, the principle of demolition of these buildings is considered acceptable subject to assessment of the redevelopment proposals. This view is supported by the Conservation Officer.</p> <p>Redevelopment proposals for the application site and the wider scheme to regenerate the area are considered in detail in the assessment of the associated application LA04/2017/2341/O and should be read in conjunction with this application. A condition is recommended that prevents partial demolition of the buildings until a valid contract has been let for redevelopment of the site to ensure that these parts of the site are not left.</p>
<p>5.6</p> <p>5.6.1</p> <p>5.6.2</p>	<p>Summary of Recommendation:</p> <p>Having regard to the relevant material considerations, including the policy context and planning history, the proposed demolitions are considered acceptable and it is recommended that Conservation Area Consent be granted.</p> <p>Delegated authority is sought for the Director of Planning and Building Control to finalise the wording of conditions.</p>
	<p>Conditions</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The works hereby permitted shall be begun not later than the expiration of 5 years beginning with the date on which this consent is granted. <p>Reason: As required by Section 105 of the Planning Act (Northern Ireland) 2011.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. In accordance with Section 105 of the Planning Act (NI) 2011, the buildings shall not be demolished until a contract for the redevelopment of the site in accordance with the proposals under application reference LA04/2017/2341/O and any subsequent associated detailed planning approval has been agreed, and evidence of that contract has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Council. <p>Reason: To ensure the implementation of a satisfactory replacement scheme in the interests of the Belfast City Conservation Area.</p>
	<p>Notification to Department (if relevant)</p>

	If Members are minded to approve the application, the Council will be required to notify DFI under Sections 105(6) of the Planning Act (Northern Ireland) 2011.
--	---

ANNEX	
Date Valid	11th October 2017
Date First Advertised	10th November 2017
Date Last Advertised	20th September 2019
Details of Neighbour Notification (all addresses)	
ES Requested	Yes

APPENDIX 1 – RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY**Current Outline planning application and associated consents**

The table below sets out the applications and consents currently under consideration for the revised scheme.

Planning Application Reference	Address	Proposal
LA04/2017/2341/O	Land Bounded by Royal Avenue, York Street and Church Street to the North; North Street to the west; Rosemary Street to the south and High Street to the south; and Donegall Street to the east. The site is located approximately 300m west of Laganside Bus Station, 300m northeast of City Hall and 900m northwest of Central Train Station.	Application for outline planning permission for demolition, redevelopment and part change of use to create a mixed use development comprising retail, offices, cafe/restaurant, residential, hotel, cultural/community space, parking, servicing, access and circulation arrangements, the creation of new streets, the configuration of Writers Square, public realm works, landscaping and associated site and road works. The proposal includes works to alter listed buildings, restoration of retained listed buildings and facades, and partial demolition of North Street Arcade, retaining its facades. Details of the retained elements of the Listed Braddells building, Former Assembly Rooms and North Street Arcade facades are provided along with the layout of the new Arcade
LA04/2017/2350/DCA	16-24 Donegall Street (BT1 2GP), 13-31 North Street (BT1 1NA), Belfast.	Demolition of buildings at 20-22 Donegall Street and 29a-31 North Street. Partial demolition of buildings with frontages retained at 16-18 Donegall Street, 24 Donegall Street, 13-15 North Street, 17-23 North Street and 25-29 North Street,

Extant scheme approvals and consents

The table below sets out the applications and consents relating to the extant scheme.

Planning Application Reference/ Decision	Address	Proposal
Z/2010/1532/F Permission granted 11 October 2012	Lands bounded by nos. 31-101 Royal Avenue, Church Street, William Street, Writers Square Nos 40 to 16 Donegall Street, No.2 waring Street, 1-21 Bridge Street, Nos 2-18 High Street, Nos1-27 Lombard Street, Nos 33 to 55 Rosemary Street and including North Street and Nos 2-14 Lower Garfield Street	Demolition, redevelopment and part change of use of existing buildings to create mixed use development comprising retail, offices, café/bar use, 2no. retail pavilions, 205 apartments including 6 no. live/work units, with associated energy centre, service areas and above ground car parking, cultural/arts centre, hotel, 2-level basement car park and associated access and circulation, creation of new streets and public spaces, reconfiguration of Writers Square, public realm works, landscaping and associated site and road works. Application also comprises works to restore, alter and extend listed buildings and facades and partial demolition of North Street Arcade retaining its facades, partial reconstruction of end blocks and reconstruction of rotunda on original location.
Z/2010/1484/DCA Consent granted 08 October 2012	Nos. 16-24 Donegall Street (BT1 2GP) 5-9 and 13-31 North Street, Belfast, BT1 1NA.	Retention of frontage to no. 16-18 and 24 Donegall Street and demolition of rear of building nos. 16-24 Donegall Street, Demolition of nos. 5-9 and 13-31 North Street, Belfast

Variations to extant scheme

The table below sets out the applications and consents relating varied the original approval for the extant scheme.

Planning Application Reference/ Decision	Address	Proposal
<p>LA04/2016/2327/F</p> <p>Permission granted 23 January 2017</p>	<p>Lands bounded by Nos. 31-101 Royal avenue, Church Street, William Street, Writers Square, Nos. 40 to 16 Donegall Street, No. 2 Waring Street, 1-21 Bridge Street, Nos. 2-18 High Street, Nos 1-27 Lombard Street and Nos. 2-14 Lower Garfield Street, Belfast</p>	<p>Application to Vary conditions 2-4 (demolition and construction), 6, 8-13 (traffic and parking), 14-18 (contaminated land), 21-22, 25, 27, 29 (landscaping), 30-31 (archaeology) and 33 (environmental designations) of planning permission Z/2010/1532/F for the demolition, redevelopment and part change of use of existing buildings to create mixed use development known as Royal Exchange, comprising retail, offices, café/bar use, apartments, car parking, cultural/arts centre, hotel and associated access and circulation and public realm works, including restoration, alteration and extension of listed buildings.</p>
<p>LA04/2016/1620/DCA</p> <p>Consent granted 23 January 2017</p>	<p>Nos.16-24 Donegall Street (BT1 2GP) 5-9 and 13-31 North Street Belfast BT1 1NA</p>	<p>Variation of condition 1 (contract for carrying out works approved under planning application ref. Z/2010/1532/F) of demolition within a conservation area consent Z/2010/1484/DCA for the retention of frontage to no.16-18 and 24 Donegall Street and demolition of rear of building nos. 16-24 Donegall Street and Demolition of nos. 5-9 and 13-31 North Street</p>